

# FROM A CONSUMER PERSPECTIVE

## Briefings on Educational Research From The Education Consumers Consultants Network

[www.education-consumers.com](http://www.education-consumers.com)

Phone & Fax - (423) 282-6832

May 2002

Volume 2, Number 5

Charles Arthur, M.S.Ed.  
President and Executive Director /  
Mastery Learning Institute / Portland,  
OR

Virginia P. Baxt, Ed.D.  
President / Education Agenda, Inc.

Wayne Bishop, Ph.D.  
Professor of Mathematics /  
Department of Mathematics and  
Computer Science / California State  
University-Los Angeles

William L. Brown, Ph.D.  
Senior Researcher / Lansing (MI)  
Community College

Guy Bruce, Ed.D.  
President / A.P.E. Consulting

Louis Chandler, Ph.D.  
Professor & Chairman / Department  
of Psychology in Education / School  
of Education / University of Pittsburgh

Andrea Clements, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor / College of  
Education / East Tennessee State  
University

Donald Crawford, Ph.D.  
Professor / College of Education /  
Western Washington University

Nathan Crow, B.A.  
Founder & Principal / Littleton  
Preparatory Charter School

George K. Cunningham, Ph.D.  
Professor / School of Education /  
University of Louisville

Mary Damer, M.Ed.  
Instructor & Student Teaching  
Supervisor / Northern Illinois  
University

Edwin J. Delattre, Ph.D.  
Professor & Dean / School of  
Education / Boston University

Benjamin F. Eller, Ed.D.  
Professor / School of Education /  
Western Carolina University

Lucien Ellington, Ed. D.  
Professor / College of Education and  
Applied Professional Services /  
University of Tennessee at  
Chattanooga

John Eshleman, Ed.D.  
President / EasyLearn Systems

David R. Feeney, Ed.D.  
Director of Digital Education / Fox  
School of Business & Management /  
Temple University

Lawrence Fraley, Ed.D.  
Professor / Department of Advanced  
Educational Studies / West Virginia  
University

Carol C. Gambill, M.Ed.  
Head - Lower School / Beaufort  
Academy / Beaufort, SC

Patrick Groff, Ed.D.  
Professor of Education Emeritus / San  
Diego State University

Bonnie Grossen, Ph.D.  
Professor / College of Education /  
University of Oregon

### Featured Research:

#### ["Value-Added Achievement Gains of NBPTS-Certified Teachers in Tennessee: A Brief Report"](#)

(click title for full article)

By J. E. Stone, Ed.D.

College of Education

East Tennessee State University

### Briefing:

The National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS) was established in 1987. Funded principally by the Carnegie Foundation, major teacher unions, and the U. S. Department of Education, its mission is to set advanced proficiency standards for teachers and to certify teachers who meet those standards.

Teachers pay \$2,300 to be evaluated by the NBPTS. They prepare a lengthy portfolio, make videotapes of themselves, and take an all-day written exam. Only fully licensed and experienced teachers may apply.

States and school districts have offered powerful incentives, such as salary increases in the \$5,000 to \$7,500 per year range for successful applicants. As of January 2002, the NBPTS has certified 16,037 teachers in 19 areas of teaching. Over 20,000 more have applied.

#### Do NBPTS-Certified Teachers Improve Student Achievement?

NBPTS standards are based on research, teacher opinion, and expert judgment; but essentially they reflect the same ideas about teaching that have dominated education for decades. They are consistent with the National Council for the Accreditation of Teacher Education's (NCATE) teacher training standards and the Interstate New Teacher Assessment and Support Consortium's (INTASC) teacher licensure standards.

Several studies have attempted to show that teachers who meet NBPTS standards are truly superior in the classroom. The largest of these investigations--[a study by the Center for Educational Research and Evaluation at the University of North Carolina-Greensboro](#)--compared teachers who were awarded certification to ones who applied but were unsuccessful. The results indicated that successful applicants were higher on 11 of the 13 qualities the NBPTS considers essential to good teaching.

What neither the UNCG study nor any others found, however, is evidence that NBPTS-certified teachers are effective in improving objectively measured student achievement. Its assessment of student learning was based on work samples chosen by the participating teachers themselves--hardly an unbiased measure. Moreover, despite the key role of standardized tests in state accountability plans, the UNCG report argued that such tests are narrow, inadequate, and arbitrary.

#### Independent Studies Are Needed

Over the past decade, NBPTS has spent more than \$165 million in public and private funds formulating an evaluation process and publicizing its presumed benefits. In particular, policymakers have been urged to provide financial support for applicants and substantial rewards for successful ones--all on assumption that

Mark Herring, Ed. D.  
Professor & Dean of Libraries /  
Winthrop University

Daniel Hursh, Ph.D.  
Professor of Educational Psychology  
/ College of Human Resources &  
Education / West Virginia University

Carol Jago, M.A.  
English Teacher / Santa Monica High  
School / Director, California Reading  
& Literature Project / UCLA

Daniel Konieczko, M.Ed.  
Science Teacher / King Middle  
School / Portland, ME

Martin Kozloff, Ph.D.  
Watson Distinguished Professor /  
School of Education / University of  
North Carolina at Wilmington

Rob Kremer, M.B.A.  
President / Oregon Education  
Coalition

Elaine McEwan-Adkins, Ed.D.  
President / McEwan-Adkins Group

Richard P. Phelps, Ph.D.  
Senior Study Director / WESTAT /  
Rockville, MD

Michael Podgursky, Ph.D.  
Professor and Chairman / Department  
of Economics / University of Missouri

Linda Ross, Ph.D.  
Director and Instructional Design  
Specialist / Archimedia eLearning  
Solutions

Valerie Rutledge, Ed.D.  
Assistant Professor / College of  
Education / University of Tennessee  
at Chattanooga / Member, TN Board  
of Education

Mark C. Schug, Ph.D.  
Professor & Director / Center for  
Economic Education / University of  
Wisconsin-Milwaukee

Lewis Solmon, Ph.D.  
Dean Emeritus / UCLA Graduate  
School of Education / Senior Vice  
President / Milken Family Foundation

Robert Spangler, Ed.D.  
President / Spangler & Associates,  
LLC

J. E. Stone, Ed.D.  
Professor / Department of Human  
Development & Learning / College of  
Education / East Tennessee State  
University

Sara Tarver, Ph.D.  
Professor College of Education  
University of Wisconsin-Madison

John Towner, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus / Woodring  
College of Education / Western  
Washington University

Herbert Walberg, Ph.D.  
University Professor of Education &  
Psychology / College of Education /  
University of Illinois-Chicago

Richard Western, Ph.D.  
Professor (ret) / School of Education /  
University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee

NBPTS certification furthers the academic achievement aims of public policy. Now these claims are being called into question.

In October 2000, NBPTS President Betty Castor said of the UNCG study: "It gives us--parents, elected officials, and policymakers--the absolute highest confidence that national-board-certified teachers are providing students with a high-quality learning experience" ([October 25, 2000](#)).

Less than two years later, however, an *Education Week* headline read: "National Board is Pressed to Prove that Certified Teachers Make a Difference" ([January 30, 2002](#)). The NBPTS had called a meeting of educational researchers to propose studies that might show whether NBPTS certified teachers are truly more effective in improving measured student achievement.

What is badly needed are studies conducted independently of the NBPTS and its many stakeholders. The NBPTS has spent millions on development. Billions more have been committed on the basis of its representations. Contradictory findings such as those reported here raise questions not only about NBPTS standards but about the credibility of the NBPTS initiative.

Given the Enron/Arthur Andersen scandal, the public's sensitivity to misleading reports and conflicts of interest may be at an all-time high. Researchers who lack an arm's-length relationship with NBPTS may find themselves in the same position as the cancer researchers who worked under the auspices of the Tobacco Institute.

#### Tennessee's Data Are Not Supportive

Tennessee has more than 40 NBPTS-certified teachers. Sixteen of the 40 teach in grades three through eight and therefore have value-added "[teacher reports](#)" in the state database.

Tennessee's teacher reports summarize the annual achievement gains exhibited by each teacher's students. Using a sophisticated "mixed model" statistical methodology developed by Dr. William Sanders, student progress is estimated on the basis of how much students gain in comparison to their achievement increases in previous years. The Sanders estimates of teacher impact on learning--called "teacher-effect" scores--are considered the most fair and exact available.

Annual student achievement gains (i.e., teacher-effect scores) for the 16 TN NBPTS-certified teachers were compared to the average achievement gains of their local school systems (click the title of this briefing for the full text). Comparisons were made in as many as 5 subjects and over as many as 3 years. Achievement gains ranging from 85 to 115% of the school system mean were considered "average." Gains of 115% and above were considered "exemplary" and ones less than 85% were considered "deficient." Tennessee's school system performance standards regard 115% or more as an "A" and 85% or less as an "F."

Only 15% of the scores earned by the NBPTS-certified teachers reached 115%. Eleven percent were at or below 85%, and the rest were within the average range for their school system. In other words, on the whole, the students taught by NBPTS-certified teachers gained no more than their local peers.

NBPTS-certified teachers were similarly unexceptional as assessed by the standard used in one of Tennessee's urban school systems. A recently instituted program in Chattanooga rewards "high performing" teachers with a \$5,000 bonus. To be classified as high performing, a teacher must reach 115% in math, reading, and language for the 3 preceding years. Even if one disregards the Chattanooga program's 3-year, 3-subject requirement, none of the NBPTS teachers would have been awarded a bonus.

Clearly the findings of this study are at odds with that which the public has been given to believe about NBPTS-certified teachers. An analogy is appropriate: If a grocer bought several cases of hand-wrapped, premium, large apples and discovered 85 percent of the first box to be mediums and smalls, he would surely demand a refund and find another supplier--especially if the apples cost as much as NBPTS-certified teachers.