

FROM A CONSUMER PERSPECTIVE

Briefings on Educational Research From The Education Consumers Consultants Network

www.education-consumers.com

Phone & Fax - (423) 282-6832

March 2004

Volume 4, Number 3

Charles Arthur, M.S.Ed.
President and Executive Director /
Mastery Learning Institute /
Portland, OR

Virginia P. Baxt, Ed.D.
President / Education Agenda,
Inc.

Wayne Bishop, Ph.D.
Professor of Mathematics /
Department of Mathematics and
Computer Science / California
State University-Los Angeles

William L. Brown, Ph.D.
Senior Researcher / Lansing (MI)
Community College

Guy Bruce, Ed.D.
President / A.P.E. Consulting

Louis Chandler, Ph.D.
Professor & Chairman /
Department of Psychology in
Education / School of Education /
University of Pittsburgh

Andrea Clements, Ph.D.
Associate Professor / College of
Education / East Tennessee State
University

Donald Crawford, Ph.D.
Professor / College of Education /
Western Washington University

Nathan Crow, B.A.
Founder & Principal / Littleton
Preparatory Charter School

George K. Cunningham, Ph.D.
Professor / School of Education /
University of Louisville

Mary Damer, M.Ed.
Instructor & Student Teaching
Supervisor / Northern Illinois
University

Edwin J. Delattre, Ph.D.
Professor & Dean / School of
Education / Boston University

Benjamin F. Eller, Ed.D.
Professor / School of Education /
Western Carolina University

Featured Research:

["Empowerment and Education: Civil Rights, Expert-Advocates, and Parent Politics in Head Start, 1964-1980"](#)

(click title for full article)

By Josh Kagan
New York University School of Law
Teachers College Record, 104(3), 2002, p. 516-562.

Briefing:

The Johnson Administration was on the right track in 1964 when as part of its War on Poverty it designed a program that targeted low-income, disadvantaged three-to-five-year-old children. Head Start was conceived to level the playing field for a demographic group, then largely black, that started school without the literacy foundations that more advantaged children acquired at home and honed in private pre-school programs.

Head Start's foundational concept was that poverty abetted by racism caused families, and ultimately children, to fail educationally. Head Start would "compensate" for their poverty-induced disadvantages.

The program began with diffuse aims and over the years evolved into more a provider of social services than a means of boosting literacy. Now the Bush administration is pushing Head Start to reemphasize its cognitive development mission -- a plan actively resisted by Head Start parents and program personnel.

Kagan's essay, published in Columbia University's *Teachers College Record*, explains why Head Start -- despite scant evidence of academic effectiveness - has survived nearly four decades. It also sheds light on Head Start's cultural and political resistance to accountability for educational skills and knowledge.

Kagan shows that the coalition of academic experts and civil rights activists who created Head Start each brought a different set of assumptions and goals to the table. The academics saw poor children as the victims of poor parenting and other aspects of social disorganization associated with poverty. Correcting these conditions would benefit the children. Research indicated that poverty itself was not the problem, but rectifying the behavioral correlates of poverty -- family illiteracy and addiction, for example -- could improve school readiness.

In contrast to the academics' perspective, civil rights activists argued that poverty and social disorganization stemmed from economic exploitation and racial discrimination. In theory, family deficiencies could be reversed by correcting those conditions. Following the War on Poverty's community action strategy, activists sought to lessen the influence of established political and economic interests by creating self-help movements in local communities.

Mark Herring, Ed. D.
Professor & Dean of Libraries /
Winthrop University

Daniel Hursh, Ph.D.
Professor of Educational
Psychology / College of Human
Resources & Education / West
Virginia University

Carol Jago, M.A.
English Teacher / Santa Monica
High School / Director, California
Reading & Literature Project /
UCLA

Daniel Konieczko, M.Ed.
Science Teacher / King Middle
School / Portland, ME

Martin Kozloff, Ph.D.
Watson Distinguished Professor /
School of Education / University
of North Carolina at Wilmington

Rob Kremer, M.B.A.
President / Oregon Education
Coalition

Elaine McEwan-Adkins, Ed.D.
President / McEwan-Adkins
Group

Richard P. Phelps, Ph.D.
Senior Study Director /
WESTAT / Rockville, MD

Michael Podgursky, Ph.D.
Professor and Chairman /
Department of Economics /
University of Missouri

Linda Ross, Ph.D.
Director and Instructional Design
Specialist / Archimedia eLearning
Solutions

Valerie Rutledge, Ed.D.
Assistant Professor / College of
Education / University of
Tennessee at Chattanooga /
Member, TN Board of Education

Mark C. Schug, Ph.D.
Professor & Director / Center for
Economic Education / University
of Wisconsin-Milwaukee

Lucien Ellington, Ed. D.
Professor / College of Education
and Applied Professional
Services / University of
Tennessee at Chattanooga

John Eshleman, Ed.D.
President / EasyLearn Systems

David R. Feeney, Ed.D.
Director of Digital Education / Fox
School of Business &
Management / Temple University

Lawrence Fraley, Ed.D.
Professor / Department of
Advanced Educational Studies /
West Virginia University

Carol C. Gambill, M.Ed.
Head - Lower School / Beaufort
Academy / Beaufort, SC

Patrick Groff, Ed.D.
Professor of Education Emeritus /
San Diego State University

Bonnie Grossen, Ph.D.
Professor / College of Education /
University of Oregon

Richard Gruetzemacher, Ed.D.
Director / Planning, Evaluation,
and Institutional Research /
University of Tennessee at
Chattanooga

What resulted, however, was less a resurgence of families and communities than the creation of a political lobby for Head Start—a lobby that continues to be dominated by national education and civil rights groups.

The Head Start Lobby

In retrospect, the emergence of a Head Start lobby isn't surprising. Head Start has become a \$7 billion program serving about 1 million children. Some 200,000 paid staff – most drawn from the ranks of Head Start parents – plus 1.4 million parent volunteers, staff more than 18,000 Head Start Centers. In many cases, Head Start provides childcare, paychecks and, in some cases, purpose to parents' lives. Feel-good programs that produce fuzzy effects may be educationally ineffective but they still appeal to parents whose resources are limited.

While it is unlikely that any program would be able to compensate fully for deficits that emerge during the crucial early years, interventions that emphasize literacy and pre-literacy skills have been shown to better prepare children for school than ones taking the broader approach popular with Head Start programs. The national Head Start coalition, however, has taken the view that a greater academic emphasis threatens parent involvement and community self-determination.

In particular, the coalition—led by well-known figures such as Marian Wright Edelman of the Children's Defense Fund--opposes putting Head Start under the control of local education boards where black voices have been ignored.

But their resistance goes deeper than opposition to a change in public oversight. Civil rights activists have historically argued against what they view as patronizing forms of government assistance, i.e., assistance premised on the notion that parenting, family arrangements, lifestyles, etc. are the problem. They have, instead, favored the "democratization of power," "self-determination" and "maximum feasible participation" for recipients. Initiatives that "blame the victim" are said to be condescending and harmful to the self-esteem of both mothers and children. Worse, they may be racist.

In essence, reform has been stalemated by a continuing disagreement over who and what must change. The Bush administration wants programs that are demonstrably linked to school readiness and that hold parents and teachers responsible for results. By contrast, most Head Start programs target broad social and developmental outcomes and blame racism and a lack of funding for their lack of effectiveness. Instead of targeting school readiness, typical programs seek to validate racial and cultural differences and improve self-esteem.

Kagan believes that Head Start has been successful in implementing a "two-generational approach to lifting families out of poverty," and he suggests that Head Start should cooperate with the schools in boosting literacy outcomes. However, he also suggests that schools should become more like Head Start and move beyond child literacy to the enhancement of families.

So long as Head Start provides many advantages and few burdens for its adult stakeholders, continued stalemate is the most likely outcome. As matters stand, Head Start provides attractive services for children, jobs for parents, and a degree of self-determination for local programs. Rigorous accountability for improved preschool literacy outcomes could disrupt all three. In effect, Head Start's constituents are being rewarded for addressing the problem of school preparedness but not for solving it.

Lewis Solmon, Ph.D.
Dean Emeritus / UCLA Graduate
School of Education / Senior Vice
President / Milken Family
Foundation

Robert Spangler, Ed.D.
President / Spangler &
Associates, LLC

J. E. Stone, Ed.D.
Professor / Department of Human
Development & Learning / College
of Education / East Tennessee
State University

Sara Tarver, Ph.D.
Professor College of Education
University of Wisconsin-Madison

John Towner, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus / Woodring
College of Education / Western
Washington University

Herbert Walberg, Ph.D.
University Professor of Education
& Psychology / College of
Education / University of Illinois-
Chicago

Richard Western, Ph.D.
Professor (ret) / School of
Education / University of
Wisconsin-Milwaukee

The Education Consumers Consultants Network is an alliance of experienced and credentialed educators dedicated to serving the needs of parents, policymakers, and taxpayers for independent and consumer-friendly consulting. For more information, contact J. E. Stone, Ed.D., at (423) 282-6832, or write: professor@education-consumers.com